Report on implementation of the Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity

Portugal

Second Review

ILGA Portugal

2018

This publication was supported by ILGA-Europe’s Human Rights Violations Documentation Fund in the framework of the project “2nd Round of Monitoring Implementation of the Committee of Ministers' Recommendation”. The opinions expressed in the document do not necessarily reflect the positions of ILGA-Europe.
Table of Contents

I. Executive summary 5

II. Recommendations to the Portuguese Government for priority actions towards the implementation of CM Recommendation (2010)5 7

III. Introduction 8

IV. Findings 12
   A. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe CM/Rec(2010)5 12
   B. Appendix to Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 14
      i. Right to life, security and protection from violence 14
         a. “Hate crimes” and other hate-motivated incidents 14
         b. “Hate speech” 16
      ii. Freedom of association 18
      iii. Freedom of expression and peaceful assembly 19
      iv. Respect for private and family life 19
      v. Respect for private and family life and access to health care – trans issues 20
      vi. Employment 22
      vii. Education 24
      viii. Health 26
      ix. Housing 28
      x. Sports 29
      xi. Right to seek asylum 31
      xii. National human rights structures 31

V. About ILGA Portugal 33
I Executive summary

Of the 12 letters sent by ILGA Portugal to the competent national Ministries and Public entities, six replies were received: from the Ministries of Internal Affairs, of National Defense and of Labour, Solidarity and Social Security; from the Secretaries of State for Equality and Citizenship and of Youth and Sports; and, from the Regulatory Authority for the Media. Unfortunately, the Ministries of Education, of Justice and of Health; the Secretaries of State for Parliamentary Affairs and for Housing; and, the Ombudsperson Office did not respond to our queries. Hence, information involving the issues for which they are responsible is based on public knowledge and the experience of lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans and intersex (LGBTI) groups.

Many issues addressed by the Recommendation and its Annex have been systematically to some extent implemented since the adoption of the Recommendation in 2010. The previous report¹ published by ILGA Portugal highlighted room for improvement and set guidance to the Portuguese Government and other institutions as to Portugal’s international human rights obligations in the area of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics (SOGIESC).

Notwithstanding, the social climate in Portugal is still quite anti-LGBTI and there are no assessments of the impact of legislation in the LGBTI community or in the Portuguese society. In addition, Portugal still does not collect data on the experiences of LGBTI persons, including crimes committed against the community, despite constant claims from civil society organisations and international organisations. Most of the surveys with specific data available are either conducted by LGBTI NGOs or by international organisations, such as the EU or the Council of Europe.

Key stakeholders and public officials still need training on sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics in order to adequately provide services and support to LGBTI persons and their families. Considering all of the above, it is interesting to note that most of the Recommendations for the Portuguese Government for priority actions laid out in 2012 are still part of the Recommendations’ set of the following page. As mentioned earlier, Portugal has achieved great progress in recognising rights to LGBTI people, but continues to fail in developing coherent, transversal and sustainable policies. Equality is not achieved solely by enacting laws, but rather analysing the effectiveness and appropriateness of such legislations. In addition, Equality and Human Rights can only be secured by access to inclusive education and adequate training for professionals, which must be replicated within their respective structures. Social change and real acceptance are imperative in a country ranked 7th in the Rainbow Europe Map and Index.²

² The Rainbow Europe Map and Index is available here: https://rainbow-europe.org/ (last consulted on 26 July 2018).
II Recommendations to the Portuguese Government for priority actions towards the implementation of CM Recommendation (2010)5

1. Adopt a comprehensive anti-discrimination law including the grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics;

2. Include gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics as prohibited grounds for discrimination under Article 13º of the Constitution;

3. Include references to sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics in specific scattered legislation (such as in education, health, etc);

4. Amend the criminal complaints registration system in order to reflect the nature of the crime’s motivation and to effectively collect official data of hate crimes committed against LGBTI persons;

5. Collect appropriate and relevant data in order to effectively combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics;

6. Create specific public services clearly mandated to address and redress situations of discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics;

7. Effectively mainstream sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics issues through public administration;

8. Create and adopt specific health guidelines to offer adequate and competent health-related services to LGBTI persons and their families;

9. Encourage public and private institutions and schools to adopt comprehensive and inclusive codes of conduct;
10. Provide specific and appropriate training on human rights and sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics-related rights to public officials.

III Introduction

Background

On 31 March 2010 the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe adopted its Recommendation to Member States “on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity”.3

It was an historic moment. The Recommendation is, as Council of Europe Secretary-General, Thorbjørn Jagland recognised, the world’s first international legal instrument dealing specifically with discrimination on these grounds, which he described as "one of the most long-lasting and difficult forms of discrimination to combat".4

In broad terms the Recommendation does three things:

- It emphasises the key principle, that human rights are universal and apply to all individuals, including therefore LGBT persons;
- It acknowledges the fact of the centuries-old and continuing discrimination experienced by LGBT persons on account of their sexual orientation or gender identity;
- It recognises that specific action is required to ensure the full enjoyment of human rights by LGBT persons, and sets out the measures required of Member States’ governments.

The Recommendation was agreed unanimously by the 47 Council of Europe Member States. Although, as a Recommendation rather than a Convention, it is

---

3 The Recommendation is available, in various languages, here: https://www.coe.int/en/web/sogi/rec-2010-5 (last consulted on 26 July 2018).

4 “Council of Europe to advance human rights for lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender persons”, available at: https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=1607163&Site=DC&BackColorInternet=F5CA75&BackColorIntranet=F5CA75&BackColorLogged=A9BACE (last consulted on 7 September 2012).
not legally binding, it is based solidly on the existing legally binding international and European human rights obligations of the Member States, which therefore have a clear duty to implement its main elements.

The Recommendation has three parts:
1. a preamble, which sets out the background to its adoption, and the key principles guiding it;
2. the operative section of the Recommendation, which is very brief, listing broad measures to be taken;
3. an Appendix which sets out specific measures to ensure enjoyment of rights and combat human rights violations across a wide range of areas, including hate crimes, hate speech, freedom of association, expression and assembly, right to respect for private and family life, employment, education, health and housing, sports, the right to seek asylum, and discrimination on multiple grounds. It also includes a section on the role of national human rights structures.

The Recommendation is supported by an Explanatory Memorandum, which documents the international human rights instruments and legal precedents on which the individual measures in the Recommendation and the Appendix are based.

The first review process of the Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 took place in 2013. Shadow reporting by LGBTI civil society organisations, including ILGA Portugal, ensured that the process gained relevance and insightful information. The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) at its 77th meeting adopted its report on the implementation of the Recommendation encouraging Member States “to continue their efforts to implement the various provisions of the

---

5 The Explanatory Memorandum of the Recommendation is available, in English, at: https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectID=090000016805cf450 (last consulted on 26 July 2018).
Recommendation. In 2017 the CDDH committed itself in conducting the second follow-up exercise to the Recommendation following the first follow-up done in 2013.

The current documentation report on monitoring the implementation of the Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 in Portugal is a part of the second follow-up exercise and seeks to provide an overview on the status quo in Portugal and to contribute to a wider, European perspective on the actual implementation of the Recommendation in all Member States.

**The purpose of this report**

The purpose of this report is to review the progress, if any, made by the Portuguese authorities in implementing the Recommendation, and to highlight the areas where further action is needed. By adding-up to the previous review process, analysing which measures have, and which have not, been completed, it strengthens the LGBTI advocacy efforts at the national and European level.

As its predecessor, the present report has two main target audiences: at national level, the policymakers and civil servants who are responsible for implementing the Recommendation; and, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, which agreed, on adopting the Recommendation, that it would conduct a second review of progress towards its implementation and it is intended that this report will contribute to that review process.

**Methodology**

The report's assessment of progress is based on a checklist of specific detailed measures required by the Recommendation. This list of measures is derived from the text of the Recommendation and its Appendix, and supplemented by additional details set out in the Explanatory Memorandum.

---

The data used to assess progress in implementation have been obtained from the following sources:

- Responses from individual ministries/public entities to letters from ILGA Portugal listing the relevant checklist questions, and asking for comments on actions taken to implement the related measures;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2012 Institution</th>
<th>2018 Institution</th>
<th>Reply</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture, Sea, Environment and Spatial Planning</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Economy and Employment</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Education and Science</td>
<td>Ministry of Internal Administration</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Internal Administration</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour, Solidarity and Social</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Justice</td>
<td>Ministry of National Defense</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of National Defense</td>
<td>Secretary of State for Parliamentary Affairs</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Solidarity and Social Security</td>
<td>Secretary of State for Housing</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary of State Assistant to the Minister Assistant and of Parliamentary Affairs</td>
<td>Secretary of State for Equality and Citizenship</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary of State for Parliamentary Affairs and Equality</td>
<td>Secretary of State for Youth and Sports</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary of State for Youth and Sports</td>
<td>Ombudsperson Office</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ombudsperson Office</td>
<td>Regulatory Authority for the Media</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory Authority for the Media</td>
<td>V</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Information from published sources, such as international organisation’s reports or news articles;
- Research and documentation assembled by ILGA Portugal and other non-governmental organisations.
IV Findings

A. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe CM/Rec(2010)5

The operative text of the Recommendation includes four main requirements: a review of existing measures to eliminate any discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, introduction of effective measures to combat such discrimination, ensuring that victims have access to effective legal remedies, and ensuring that the Recommendation is translated and disseminated as widely as possible. It also requires that member states be guided by the principles and measures contained in the Appendix to the Recommendation.

In comparison with the 2012 report, much legislation has been enacted and revised in order to include sexual orientation and gender identity. But, Article 13° of the Constitution (general principle of discrimination) still only mentions sexual orientation – even though the Labour Code (in 2015), the Criminal Code (in 2013) and other scattered legislation already mention gender identity as a prohibit ground for discrimination. As in 2012, there is still no protection from discrimination on the grounds of SOGIESC in access to goods and services, education, health and social protection.

In addition, when reporting a crime it is still not possible to disaggregate data to reflect the nature of the motivation of the crime, thus there is no available data on hate crimes committed against the LGBTI community, which of course affects the enactment of specific policies on violence and discrimination.

Though the Recommendation and its Appendix are now more known to specific key actors, it is still a widely unknown document to the general public. This also
impairs the need to reply to requests for information, especially when done by civil society organisations.

Regarding redress mechanisms, the situation maintains as reported in 2012: the existing mechanisms are generic and their effectiveness is arguable. Though it is worthy of note that public institutions and key professional are, in general, much more aware of discrimination against LGBTI persons and available to assist and inform victims of their rights even if not clearly mandated to do so.

### General Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adopt a comprehensive anti-discrimination law including the grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Include gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics as prohibited grounds for discrimination under Article 13º of the Constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Include references to sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics in scattered legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collect appropriate and relevant data in order to effectively combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create specific public services clearly mandated to address and redress situations of discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectively mainstream sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics issues through public administration;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide specific and appropriate training on human rights and sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics-related rights to public officials.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. Appendix to Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5

i. Right to life, security and protection from violence

a. “Hate crimes" and other hate-motivated incidents

The key recommendations in Section I.A of the Appendix cover training of police officers, judiciary and prison staff, the introduction of independent machinery for investigating hate crimes allegedly committed by law-enforcement and prison staff, and a range of measures to combat "hate crimes" and hate motivated incidents on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, including hate crimes legislation. Member states are also required to gather and analyse data on the prevalence and nature of discrimination in this field.

Hate crimes are not an autonomous criminal offence in Portugal, but are recognised as aggravating penalties for the crimes of qualified murder and offense to physical integrity.

In addition to sexual orientation, the Criminal Code was amended in 2013 to also include gender identity as a covered ground for aggravating circumstances, thus enlarging the scope of protection in case of hate crimes.  

Sexual orientation and gender identity issues are allegedly part of the security forces’ trainings, but in reality these trainings are dependent of civil society organisations’ capacity. In this regard, ILGA Portugal has a proposal for a protocol of cooperation (which includes training activities) with the Ministry of Internal Affairs and with GNR (the military security force) pending of decision since, respectively, 2014 and 2013. Notwithstanding, Portugal is part of the training for security forces to implement the Council of Europe manual “Policing

---

7 Amended by Law n.º 19/2013, of 21 February.
Hate Crime against LGBTI persons: Training for a Professional Police Response but the national trainings have yet to be implemented.

There are specific units to assist and investigate crimes committed against specific/vulnerable victims (terminology that includes LGBTI persons) but there are no specific units to investigate hate crimes/incidents committed against LGBTI persons. In addition, there are no liaison officers tasked to address these issues or to maintain contact with the community and none of the existing complaints mechanisms are anonymous, which hardens the complaints rate and trust levels with the security forces.

Nevertheless, in 2016 three specific LGBTI victim support services got a direct yearly renewable grant from the Secretary of State for Citizenship and Equality. All three are run by LGBTI NGOs: ILGA Portugal and Casa Qui both in Lisboa and Centro Gis in Matosinhos. Of the three, only one, run by Casa Qui, is specifically designed to support LGBTI youth.

In partnership with other European LGBTI organisations, ILGA Portugal developed a specific reporting mechanism in 2017 – UNI-FORM – and liaised with the Ministry of Internal Affairs and representatives of the security forces to include the national authorities in the actual reporting system and to enable victims to report directly to an LGBTI NGO and to the security force. Despite efforts to engage them, which would implement not only this Recommendation but also provisions of the Victims Rights Directive, also in 2017 the Portuguese Security Forces refused to join the project considering there was no need to join a specific reporting mechanism. In the process of drafting this report, ILGA Portugal met with the Minister of Internal Affairs who showed willingness to change the status quo and to understand the restrictions noted by the security

---

8 The manual is available, in English, at: https://rm.coe.int/prems-030717-gbr-2575-hate-crimes-against-lgbti-web-a4/1680723b1d (last consulted on 24 July 2018).
11 More information about Centro Gis is available, in Portuguese, here: https://www.facebook.com/CentroGis/ (last consulted on 26 July 2018).
12 More information about UNI-FORM is available here: https://uni-form.eu/ (last consulted on 17 June 2018).
forces in order to duly address them in line with its international obligations. ILGA Portugal will be closely following up this meeting and possible outcomes.

The Portuguese State does not collect official data on hate crimes against LGBTI persons, despite recurring efforts to raise-awareness of the authorities to need to do so from civil society organisations.

The new National Strategy for Equality and Non-Discrimination\(^{13}\) includes, for the first time, a specific LGBTI Action Plan which in turn foresee a specific measure to elaborate a study on the current legal framework considering the existing recommendations of the Council of Europe, FRA and OSCE on hate crimes and hate speech – this measure is to be implemented until the end of the LGBTI Action Plan, in December 2021.

Regarding statistical data, though it is not yet collected, the LGBTI Action Plan also encompasses a measure to develop statistics on crimes and acts of violence with homophobic, biphobic, transphobic and interphobic motivations. This measure is in line with the recommendations of the international workshop “Hate crime awareness-raising: understanding and improving hate crime recording and data collection”, which was held in Lisboa in March 2018 and organised by the Directorate-General for Justice Policy in cooperation with FRA and ODIHR.\(^{14}\)

Regarding persons deprived of their liberty, though there is a generic prohibition of discrimination, there is no mention of SOGIESC issues, or of violence prevention mechanisms. Given that the Ministry of Justice did not provide any information for this report, we have to assume that there were no structural changes to the reality reported in the previous revision cycle.


\(^{14}\) The programme of the workshop is available, in English, at: http://www.dgpj.mj.pt/sections/noticias/workshop-internacional/downloadFile/attachedFile_f0/Programa.pdf?nocache=1521214338.92 (last consulted on 3 July 2018).
Notwithstanding, in 2014 ILGA Portugal was contacted by the General Directorate of Rehabilitation and Prison Services to provide training to staff and youngsters of an educational centre (facility for youngsters deprived of their liberty) ahead of the integration of a trans woman who was teaching there. The best-practice and successful integration of the teacher led to a Rainbow Award to the particular educational centre.

During 2017, ILGA Portugal accompanied a case of a trans woman deprived of their liberty. Though placed in a male facility, the prison staff was quite sensitive to the need to protect this woman and referred to her always using her name and female pronouns. ILGA Portugal was directly contacted by the prison staff who were trying to understand how to better assist her with specific needs and how to better prepare her release from the facilities and create some support network. Given that there is no clear guidance nor guidelines to prison facilities on LGBTI inmates, it is very positive to witness the change in the structure of the system - which acknowledged its flaws and insecurities.

b. “Hate speech”

Section I.B. of the Appendix requires measures to combat “hate speech” on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, including laws penalising such "hate speech", promotion of good practice within media organisations and by internet service providers, public disavowal of such speech by government officials, guidelines to government officials to refrain from such speech and to promote respect for the human rights of LGBTI people.

In March 2018, the Criminal Code was again amended and the previously named “racial, religious and sexual discrimination” provision now refers to “discrimination and incitement to hatred and violence”, hence better framing hate speech and enlarging the protected grounds to other personal
characteristics, but maintaining sexual orientation and gender identity. The previous writing of this provision was widely criticised for its inapplicability and vague framing which made it impossible to file successful complaints. The new wording, though still imperfect, is much more in line with the claims of civil society.

Furthermore, it has become common to find anti-LGBTI online comments and to date no appropriate measures (guidelines or public statements) to combat it have been adopted by public entities. Despite this, the counter-terrorism unit of the Criminal Investigation Police is now trying to work in close connection with civil society organisations and social media platforms in order to monitor and combat online hate speech.

**Recommendations on Hate Crime and Hate Speech**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amend the existing criminal complaints registration system in order to reflect the nature of the crime’s motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectively collect official data of anti-LGBTI hate crimes and hate speech online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide appropriate and adequate training to Security Forces, including front-liners</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ii. Freedom of association


16 ILGA Portugal publishes an yearly report on anti-LGBTI hate crimes and hate speech in Portugal, where some examples of online comments can be found. The reports, in Portuguese, are available at: [http://ilga-portugal.pt/observatorio/](http://ilga-portugal.pt/observatorio/) (last consulted on 26 July 2018).

17 This proximity is a direct consequence of the work developed in the framework of the European Commission Subgroup on countering online hate speech. Portugal participated in the 2nd and 3rd monitoring exercise of the Code of Conduct on countering online hate speech. More information on the code of conduct and results of the monitoring exercises can be found here: [http://ec.europa.eu/newsroom/just/item-detail.cfm?item_id=54300](http://ec.europa.eu/newsroom/just/item-detail.cfm?item_id=54300) (last consulted on 26 July 2018).
Section II of the Appendix requires member states to take appropriate measures to ensure that LGBT organisations can gain official registration, are able to operate freely, are involved on a partnership basis when framing and implementing public policies which affect LGBT persons, and are able to access public funding earmarked for NGOs without discrimination; also, that LGBT human rights organisations are protected effectively from hostility and aggression.

There is no record of any difficulties encountered by LGBTI organisations to operate or to access public funding. The issue of concern, which is common to any NGO in Portugal, is the lack of structural funding as most organisations depend of project funding, thus neither long-term nor sustainable.

**iii Freedom of expression and peaceful assembly**

Section IV of the Appendix requires member states to guarantee freedom of expression and peaceful assembly to LGBT people, ensuring the freedom to receive and transmit information and ideas relating to sexual orientation and gender identity, encouraging pluralism and non-discrimination in the media, protection of lawful assemblies, and condemnation by public authorities of any interference with the exercise of the right to freedom of expression and peaceful assembly by LGBT people.

There is no record of restrictions to freedom of expression an peaceful assembly.

**iv. Respect for private and family life (excluding specific trans issues)**  
(Section IV, paras 18, 19, and 23 – 27 of the Appendix)

These paragraphs of Section IV of the Appendix address criminalisation of same-sex sexual acts, collection of personal data, and discrimination in access to the rights of couples and parenting.
In 2016, after years of civil society lobbying and failed legislative processes, parenting rights and access to assisted reproduction techniques became a reality for the LGBTI community. Laws n.º 2/2016 and 17/2016, respectively, enlarge access to adoption and second parent adoption to same sex couples and grant access to assisted reproduction techniques to lesbian couples and to any woman (regardless of her sexual orientation or civil status). Surrogacy is not possible for gay couples.

Despite this, in April 2018 the Constitutional Court ruled against specific provisions of Law n.º 17/2016, and its subsequent regulation, in particular against the anonymity of the donor and the exemption of legal investigation of biological paternity arguing for the right of the child to his/hers personal identity. Though the law is still in force, it is now suspended until Parliament considers the necessary changes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations on Private and Family Life – excluding specific trans issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clarify the Law on access to Assisted Reproduction Techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enlarge the scope of surrogacy also to include gay couples</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

v. Respect for private and family life and access to health care – specific trans issues (Section IV of the Appendix, paras 20, 21 and 22, and Section VII, paras 35 and 36)

These paragraphs of Section IV of the Appendix require member states to guarantee the full legal recognition of a person's gender reassignment in a quick, transparent and accessible way, to remove any prior requirements for legal recognition that are abusive (including any of a physical nature), and

---


ensure that trans persons are able to marry once gender reassignment has been completed. The paragraphs of Section VII require member states to ensure that transgender persons have effective access to appropriate gender reassignment services, and that any decisions limiting the costs covered by health insurance should be lawful, objective and proportionate.

Legal gender recognition is still possible under the provisions of Law n.7/2011. There are numerous constraints to the implementation of this law, which were collected and reported in a study conducted by ILGA Portugal and ISCTE-IUL on the implementation of the law. In summary, this study concluded that there was a need to assure:

1. *de facto* separation of the legal and clinical spheres, hence enabling for the autonomy and self-determination of trans people in the legal gender recognition of their identities;
2. the possibility to have legal gender recognition for minors: administratively for people between 16 and 18 years old; and by judicial decision for minors under the age of 16 – always respecting the child’s best interest;
3. the possibility of legal recognition of non-binary identities;
4. access to legal gender recognition to foreigners legally residing in Portugal by means of acknowledgement of their gender identity in the documents issued by the Portuguese State.

In April 2018 the Portuguese Parliament approved a new gender identity law that addresses many of the issues pointed out in the referred study and inclusive of intersex rights. The President of the Portuguese Republic then vetoed the law in May and on 12 July, the Parliament reapproved the law which now upholds self-determination for Portuguese people of legal age; requires a non-pathologising medical report stating the person’s free and informed will to resort to the civil registry for legal gender recognition if the person is between 16 and 18 years old; recognises everyone’s right to gender identity; prohibits discrimination on the grounds of gender identity, gender expression or sex

---

23 The law states that this report can be issued by any medical professional or psychologist duly accredited by their respective Associations and clearly mentions that the report is not pathologising.
characteristics; prohibits unnecessary medical surgeries to intersex babies and children; mandates both the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Health to adopt specific guidelines to, respectively, integrate trans and intersex children in schools and to provide adequate and competent health services to trans and intersex people. The President can now veto it again or promulgate it.

Noteworthy is the fact that during this legislative process many civil society organisations, international organisations, trans and intersex people, key experts and foreign Parliaments were heard by the Parliamentary Committee for Equality. The outcome of this new law is not perfect and is not completely in line with civil society organisations’ demands, but it was the possible compromise considering the content of the President’s veto. There is room for improvement on trans and intersex issues and LGBTI civil society organisations are hopeful that the guidelines that both Ministries will have to develop might actually bridge and address some of the identified gaps.\(^{24}\)

Regarding trans specific healthcare services, the situation has not improved, there are still difficulties in accessing surgeries, in trusting the competency and practices of clinical teams and in accessing services through the public health system.

Despite this, in October 2017 the Directorate General for Health published and disseminated an information circular explaining how health professionals should redirect trans people to the Coimbra facilities and detailing which surgeries are there available. In addition, the specific unit in the Coimbra hospital then also made available a detailed document explaining their mission, who their team is and their competencies, clarifying questions posed by trans people and their families and explaining how to reach them.\(^{25}\) This outreach effort was done with


\(^{25}\) Both documents are available, in Portuguese, at: [https://www.dgs.pt/saude-a-a-z.aspx?v=8e00381f-52ce-45fb-b5a0-35fe84fa926a#saude-de-a-a-z/transexualidade](https://www.dgs.pt/saude-a-a-z.aspx?v=8e00381f-52ce-45fb-b5a0-35fe84fa926a#saude-de-a-a-z/transexualidade) (last consulted on 14 July 2018).
the support of the Ministry of Health and in close cooperation with ILGA Portugal and AMPLOS.

**Recommendations on Respect for private and family life and access to health care – specific trans issues**

Create and adopt specific health guidelines to offer adequate and competent health-related services to trans and intersex persons and their families.

**vi. Employment**

Section V of the Appendix requires Member States to provide effective protection against discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity in employment, including legislation prohibiting discrimination, other policy related measures to combat discrimination, and specific measures in relation to the armed forces and trans persons. It also requires Member States to protect the privacy of trans individuals in employment.

In 2015 the Portuguese Labour Code was amended to explicitly prohibit discrimination in access to employment and work cases on the grounds of gender identity and to revert the burden of proof in cases where someone’s gender identity is considered relevant for the conflict. According to the Ministry of National Defense, the Statutes of the Militaries in the Armed Forces (adopted in 2015) prohibits discrimination, *inter alia*, on the grounds of sexual orientation.

Furthermore, the Portuguese Labour Conditions Authority developed a specific complaint form for cases of harassment in the workplace, where the person

---


28 The form is available, in Portuguese, at: http://www.act.gov.pt/pt-PT/Itens/QueixasDenuncias/Documents/Pedido%20de%20interven%C3%A7%C3%A3o%20pela%20pr%C3%A1tica%20de%20ass%C3%A9dio.pdf (last consulted on 14 July 2018).
reporting the situation can more accurately identify discriminatory practices and harassment in the workplace. The form explicitly mentions sexual orientation and gender identity as possible grounds for harassment and discrimination and both victims and witnesses can submit the complaint of moral and/or sexual harassment. According to the Ministry of Labour, Solidarity and Social Security, upon submission of the complaint, the Authority will classify the harassment complaint as priority and will investigate it through labour inspectors. Still in this regard, the Ministry of National Defense mentions that in accordance with the implementation of their respective ministerial plan for equality (2014-2017), the Ministry conducted a yearly awareness-raising session of LGBTI issues and sexual harassment in the workplace and the Navy conducts internal sessions on gender equality and non-discrimination through its Gender Perspective Office.\(^{29}\)

In addition, in 2016 the Portuguese Charter for Diversity\(^ {30}\) was adopted in order to encourage employers to implement and develop internal policies and procedures to promote diversity. Under the initiatives to implement the Charter, in May 2017 the Executive Committee (which includes Portuguese Public Institutions) organised an International Meeting on LGBTI Visibility and Inclusion in the Workplace,\(^ {31}\) bringing together, for the first time, Government officials, companies, employees and civil society organisations to discuss LGBTI issues in employment and work. Even though there was no specific outcome, it was an important debate and the first of its kind.

Finally, as of March 2018 the Portuguese Commission for Citizenship and Gender Identity, in cooperation with the Spanish Women and Equal Opportunities Institute and the Madrid Complutense University de Madrid, is currently implementing the Iberian project ADIM - Advancing in LGBT Diversity

\(^{29}\) According to the Ministry’s official reply, this office is intended to be an open minded space where Navy officials can pose questions, suggest changes and get professional-personal guidance.


Management in the Public and Private Sector. The project aims at promoting LGBTI diversity policies in public and private companies, through the adoption of a guide for diversity management and training. Portuguese LGBTI organisations were invited to become members of the project’s advisory council.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations on Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encourage public and private institutions and companies to adopt comprehensive and inclusive codes of conduct</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

vii. Education

Section VI of the Appendix requires member states to ensure that the right to education can be enjoyed without discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, including measures to provide protection from bullying and social exclusion such as equality and safety policies, codes of conduct and training programmes for staff, and measures to promote mutual tolerance and respect in schools, including objective information in school curricula and educational materials, specific information and support for LGBT pupils and students, and measures to meet the special needs of transgender students.

Given that the Ministry of Education did not provide input to this report we will assume that there were no structural changes or improvements for LGBTI persons in the school environment.

In 2016 there was a journalistic piece exposing the long-term discriminatory practices of exclusion, prohibition of affections and possible expulsions and transfers of LGB students of the Military College. After the widespread news and reports (also from victims) the Minister of Defense publicly condoned discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation, and dismissed the Chief of

---

32 The piece is available, in Portuguese, at: https://observador.pt/especiais/vida-no-colegio-militar-parece-um-big-brother/ (last consulted on 18 July 2018).
the General Staff of the Army and other high-ranking officials in the Military College.

In 2017, a lesbian couple kissed in public in a secondary school in Vagos (town in the north of Portugal). The school Board and other school staff reprimanded the students for “not being respectful in public” despite public statements mentioning that the situation had nothing to do with the students’ sexual orientation. In response to this case, a group of dozens of students of the school organised a peaceful demonstration in the school and it became viral in social media. Their reaction originated the movement #SchoolWithoutHomophobia, enabling similar protests in other schools in Portugal.

ILGA Portugal is currently implementing an education project in the North, which intends to create Alliances of Diversity (similar to Gay Straight Alliances) and which is funded by the Portugal2020 grants. In relation to the project, in June we launched the results of the National School Climate Survey where participants completed an online survey about their experiences in school during the 2016-2017 school year, including hearing biased remarks, feeling safe, being harassed, and feeling comfortable at school. They were also asked about their academic experiences, attitudes about school, involvement in school, and availability of supportive school resources. Youth were eligible to participate in the survey if they were between the ages of 14 and 20, attended a primary or secondary school in Portugal during the 2016-2017 school year, and identified as lesbian, gay, bisexual, or a sexual orientation other than heterosexual (e.g., pansexual, questioning) or described themselves as transgender or as having another gender identity does not match sex/gender they were assigned at birth).

The data seems to indicate that in many situations schools are not really safe spaces, and where negative attitudes and comments, insults and experiences of harassment and even violence occur all too often. On the other hand, there seems to be a relationship between effective support or meaning on the part of

---

the school community (through attitudes towards discrimination, language, resources and educational policies), and experiences of discrimination, belonging and absenteeism of LGBTI students. In general, the experiences shared by 663 young people who identify themselves as LGBTI indicate that the more inclusive and open the school is to diversity, the less it seems to be the prevalence of discrimination and its impact, which seems to need to invest in more resources, more specialized training, more sensitization and more training of young people and teaching and non-teaching staff against discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender identity or expression and sexual characteristics.34

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations on Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encourage public and private schools to adopt comprehensive and inclusive codes of conduct</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

viii. Health - other than transgender specific health issues35 (Section VII of the Appendix paragraphs 33, 34,)

These paragraphs of Section VII of the Appendix require member states to ensure that the highest attainable standard of health can be enjoyed without discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity. Measures include taking account of the specific needs of LGBT people in the development of national health plans, including suicide prevention measures, health surveys, curricula and training courses, permitting patients to identify their "next of kin" without discrimination, withdrawing medical textbooks and other documents that treat homosexuality as a disease, and ensuring no one is forced to undergo any medical treatment because of their sexual orientation or gender identity.

34 The results of the study are available, in Portuguese, at: http://ilga-portugal.pt/ficheiros/pdfs/ILGA_ENAE_2016-2017.pdf (last consulted on 23 July 2018). An English version is also available upon request by email to add@ilgaportugal.pt
35 See Section v above.
The Ministry of Health did not reply to our request for information, thus the information here provided is based upon knowledge publicly available.

In 2014, ILGA Portugal conducted the first ever study on the challenges experienced by LGBT persons when accessing adequate and competent healthcare services in Portugal.\(^{36}\) The study main findings state that an average of 70% of health professionals assumes that the patient is heterosexual or has exclusive sexual behaviours with persons of the opposite legal gender; that 66% of the respondents does not refer their sexual orientation and sexual behaviours due to fear of discrimination; that 17% of LGB persons had already been discriminated in healthcare services; or, that in 11% of mental health appointments it had been suggested that homosexuality can be “cured”. The data collected also show that the barriers - already identified in the past - in the access to health by trans people continue to be present, namely: non-compliance with international guidelines; the need for approval by the Medical Association for access to specific treatments; or, the general lack of knowledge about practices and resources available in the National Health System.

After reports of discrimination in blood donation, in 2017 the Directorate-General for Health issued a norm\(^{37}\) on blood donation, sexual behaviours and criteria for donor exclusion that changes the paradigm in the field, by abandoning the group criteria, and in particular the group of Men who have Sex with Men (MSM), to focus on risky sexual behaviour. This norm moves away from the sexual orientation of the donor, and imposes no restrictions to gay and bisexual men (on the account of their sexual orientation) only focusing on the stated sexual behaviour and habits of any potential donor.

\(^{36}\) The complete study is available, in Portuguese, at: [http://igualdadenasaude.ilga-portugal.pt/](http://igualdadenasaude.ilga-portugal.pt/) (last consulted on 20 July 2018).

Recommendations on Health

Create and adopt specific health guidelines to offer adequate and competent health-related services to LGBTI persons and their families.

ix. Housing

Section VIII of the Appendix requires that access to adequate housing can be enjoyed without discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity through such measures as prohibiting discrimination in the sale or rent of housing, in provision of loans for purchase of housing, in recognition of the rights of a tenant's partner, and in the case of evictions; also, provision of related information to landlords and tenants, and measures to ensure non-discriminatory access to shelter and emergency accommodation, and to address the risks of homelessness faced by LGBT people, including young persons excluded by their families.

There is no reference to discrimination on the grounds of SOGIESC in the existing housing legislation. In addition, there is no record of programme or policies developed for LGBTI youth.

In 2017 the National Strategy for the Integration of Homeless People: Prevention, Intervention and Monitoring, 2017-2023, was adopted, which defines a homeless person as a person who, “regardless nationality, racial or ethnic origin, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, socio-economic status and physical and mental health status, is:

. homeless, living in the public space, housed in an emergency shelter or with a whereabouts in a precarious place; or

. without a home, being in temporary accommodation intended for this purpose.”

---

38 The Plan is available, in Portuguese, at: http://www.enipssa.pt/documents/10180/11749/Resolu%C3%A7%C3%A3o+do+Conselho+de+Ministros+n.%C2%BA+107+2017/667537bf-d530-46f5-8cec-79831f9e3908 (last consulted on 17 July 2018).
Thus, the strategy though recent also does not include gender identity, gender expression or sex characteristics has personal characteristics to be protected.

As of May 2018, a specific emergency accommodation response exists in the North of Portugal, specifically designed to support LGBTI victims of domestic violence and/or victims of gender-based violence. The Casa Arco-Íris is a result of a project application of Associação Plano i to the Portugal 2020 grants and will also be formally supported by the Municipality of Matosinhos.\(^39\)

### x. Sports

Section IX of the Appendix requires member states to combat sexual orientation or gender identity discrimination in sports through measures to counteract and punish the use of discriminatory insults, introduce codes of conduct for sports organisations, encouragement of partnerships between LGBT organisations and sports clubs, and anti-discrimination campaigns, and to put an end to the exclusion of transgender persons from sports activity.

According to the Secretary of State for Youth and Sports, in order to comply with existing legal framework, the State, through the Portuguese Institute for Youth and Sports (IPDJ), supported financially the Project “It does not matter which team you play for”,\(^40\) celebrating a contract with rede ex aequo, the Portuguese LGBTI youth and allies organisation.

In addition, the institutional collaboration with events organized by civil society in this area is encouraged by the Government. Examples of this policy are the conference *How to make sports inclusive for the LGBTI youth?*, organised by the Portuguese LGBTI and allies youth organisation rede ex aequo in April

---


40 One of the products of this support was the production of a video spot for awareness-raising purposes, which can be found here https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VrZnnFe3Q8w
and the IDAHOT Forum, organised by the Government in Lisbon in May 2018.

Furthermore, the Government is promoting the National Program of Sports for All,\textsuperscript{42} elaborated in accordance with the international guidelines of the movement Sports for All that adopts the definition established in the European Sports Charter, in which "sport means all forms of physical activity which, through casual or organised participation, aim at expressing or improving physical fitness and mental well-being, forming social relationships or obtaining results in competition at all levels." The National Program finds its framework in the Portuguese Constitution, as well as the above-mentioned Law nº 5/2007, of 16 January, and in a large set of institutional international guidelines published by the European Union and the Council of Europe, the United Nations, the World Health Organisation and the International Olympic Committee. It defines a set of goals to achieve in the context of Sports, assuming a more active population, adopting healthier lifestyles promoters of an improved life quality and well-being. Its mission is based on pillars aimed at promoting and developing sport, education for and by sport and health promotion. In order to increase the number of project candidates and beneficiaries in the fight against discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity, this program has been disseminated next to associations and civil society organizations that promote recreational sports with LGBTI athletes.

Moreover, a non-discrimination clause was included in the contract-program’s model that entitle the IPDJ to grant any financial support, either for Sports for All or for Federated and High-Income Sport: “Combating demonstrations of violence linked to sport, doping, corruption, racism, xenophobia and all forms of discrimination, including those based on sex: Failure by the 2nd PARTY to


comply with the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment between men and women, the provisions of the Anti-Doping Authority of Portugal (ADoP) and the National Council of Sport, and, in general, to combat demonstrations of violence linked to sport, doping, corruption, racism, xenophobia and all forms of discrimination, including those based on sex, entails suspension and, where necessary, cancellation of financial contributions granted by the 1st PARTY."

The Office of the Secretary of State also noted that institutional support was provided by their office and the IPDJ, to the first delegation of Portugal for the Paris Gay Games 2018.

The official reply also mentions that in 2017, there were no reports of homophobic or transphobic insults and that the National Plan for Coach Training (currently under revision) foresees that as of 2019 SOGIESC issues will be part of the coaches training.

xi. Right to seek asylum

Section X of the Appendix requires member states, where they have international obligations in this respect, to recognise a well-founded fear of persecution based on sexual orientation or gender identity as a valid ground for the granting of refugee status and to ensure that asylum seekers are not sent to a country where their life or freedom would be threatened or they face the risk of torture, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity. It also requires that asylum seekers be protected from any discriminatory policies or practices on these grounds, and that staff responsible for processing asylum requests are provided with training in the specific problems encountered by LGBT asylum seekers.

As of 2013, international protection has been regularly granted to LGBTI asylum seekers. ILGA Portugal has closely cooperated with the immigration authorities and other organisations working on asylum issues to assure that the country of origin information is updated and corresponds to the actual situation on the
ground. Despite this, there is still no specific training for the corresponding authorities nor are there any specific public policies in place. Portugal does not have a list of countries where same-sex relationships or trans identities are criminalised and the national authorities rely on the EASO for interview tips, case analysis or knowledge on existing jurisprudence. The recently adopted LGBTI Action Plan foresees a change in legislation to enlarge the scope of the particular social group so as to also include gender expression and sex characteristics.

xii. National human rights structures

Section XI of the Appendix requires member states to ensure that national human rights structures are clearly mandated to address discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, and in particular should be able to make recommendations on legislation and policies, raise awareness amongst the general public, and – as far as national law provides – examine individual complaints and participate in court proceedings.

The Ombudsperson’s Office is not clearly mandated to address discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression or sex characteristics nor can it initiate or intervene in judicial proceedings. For this monitoring process we did not receive an official reply from the Office.
About ILGA Portugal

Founded in 1995, ILGA Portugal is the largest and the oldest NGO in Portugal striving for equality and against discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender expression and identity and sex characteristics.

Our mission is the social integration of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans and intersex population and their families in Portugal through a program of social support that improves the quality of life of LGBTI people and their families; through the fight against discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender expression and identity and sex characteristics; and through the promotion of full citizenship, Human Rights and gender equality.

We are a national organization and although we are based in Lisbon, we also have a project and an office in Porto.

ILGA Portugal has a strong diversity policy and very active groups devoted to specific topics such as Lesbian issues or Trans issues, as well as a group devoted to Rainbow Families. We are members of ILGA Europe's Advocacy Network, founding members of NELFA, correspondents for IDAHO, members of FRA’s Fundamental Rights Platform and of the Advisory Council of the Portuguese Commission for Citizenship and Gender Equality (national mechanism for equality).

Activities organised by ILGA Portugal:

- Arraial Lisboa Pride – the largest annual LGBTI Pride event in Portugal. Integrated in the Festas de Lisboa (Lisbon festivities), the party takes place in Terreiro do Paço, Lisbon’s most significant historical square. Stands from many NGOs and LGBT bars and restaurants also contribute towards attracting around sixty thousand people to the event. Since 2017, Arraial Lisboa Pride is formally
organised by ILGA Portugal, Lisbon Municipality, Municipal company EGEAC, Civil Parish of Santa Maria Maior and the Civil Parish of Misericórdia.

- LGBT Community Centre – where we offer a helpline (Linha LGBT), psychological and legal counselling (Serviço de Aconselhamento Psicológico and Departamento Jurídico), HIV and STI prevention, social integration service for asylum seekers and refugees (Serviço de Integração Social), a documentation centre on LGBTI issues (Centro de Documentação Gonçalo Diniz) and victim support (Serviço de Apoio a Vítimas LGBT) as well as many cultural and political events and many opportunities for volunteer work (with proper training and supervision).

- Rainbow Awards (Prémios Arco-Íris) – our annual awards ceremony recognizes and honours personalities or institutions whose work throughout the year promoted the fight against discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender expression and identity and sex characteristics.

- publications on access to rights and resources; multimedia campaigns against discrimination of LGBT people; education and training of professionals to ensure access of LGBT people to key public sectors.

- political intervention involving, among other activities, lobbying the Portuguese parties and the Government, building alliances with private and public institutions, organizing conferences or promoting petitions.